

The Mystery of the Rosary Cantorales: A Study in Attribution

Lorenzo Candelaria

YALE UNIVERSITY acquired an impressive manuscript from a Connecticut bookdealer in 1989, that has since been identified by nothing other than its call number, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Ms 710.¹ Initially, the size of this manuscript is its most striking feature. It measures an extraordinary 96 x 62 cm and contains 103 folios of vellum, each of which required the use of a full calf skin. The opening folios (Fig. 1 and 2) are magnificently decorated with a large illuminated letter featuring the Virgin and Child, splendid marginalia depicting the Labors of Hercules, and a border painting (Fig. 3) modeled after Albrecht Dürer's engraving, *Das Meerwunder*. The model engraving is datable to 1498 and provides a useful *terminus post quem* for the compilation of Beinecke Ms 710.² This accords well with other features, such as script and the overall style of decoration which reflect a date of production near the turn of the sixteenth century.

The large codex is mostly made up of all the chants necessary for singing the Ordinary of the Mass. Thus it is a liturgical choir book, one generally referred to as a Kyriale. Beinecke Ms 710 also transmits a

¹"Recent Acquisitions Briefly Noted. The Witten Purchase," *The Yale University Library Gazette* 64/3-4 (April 1990): 176-90.

²The image and its cultural significance are examined in Lorenzo Candelaria, "Hercules and Albrecht Dürer's *Das Meerwunder* in a Chantbook from Renaissance Spain," *Renaissance Quarterly* 58/1 (2005): 1-44.



Fig. 1. New Haven, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Yale University. Ms. 710, fol. 1v.



Fig. 2. New Haven, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Yale University. Ms. 710, fol. 2r.



Fig. 3. Border painting after Albrecht Dürer's *Das Meerwunder*. New Haven, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Yale University. Ms. 710, fol. 1v (detail).

polyphonic work of special interest: a four-part *Et incarnatus est* from a Credo attributed to "Josquin." It is, in fact, from the *Missa sine nomine* by Josquin Desprez. However fragmentary a portion of the complete Mass, this "new" Josquin source provides the fifth known manuscript concordance for the *Missa sine nomine* and is at present the only Josquin Mass material preserved in an American library.³

A formidable and sumptuously decorated volume, the Beinecke Kyriale has rarely failed to engage the attention of anyone who has ever seen it. For well over a decade, specialists in a variety of fields including codicology, art history, and musicology attempted to discover something about its provenance with little success. To some it seemed Flemish, to others Italian. The bookdealer it was purchased from in 1989 was unsure of its origins himself. His description notes only that the choir book was said to have come from Switzerland.⁴

The Kyriale is in fact Spanish. Several features might have suggested this immediately were it not that Spanish chant sources beyond the medieval period have generally received little attention from scholars. The very size of this manuscript might have been noticed as an obvious starting point. While large choirbooks can be found in other regions, it is mostly among Spanish sources that we find such enormous tomes of almost exaggerated proportions. Indeed, this Kyriale comes across as a more modest example when we consider the size of each of over 200 chant books now at the former Hieronymite monastery of El Escorial, near Madrid. Each of the Escorial's chantbooks measures what must be a record 108 × 75 cm and comes mounted on four small wheels along the lower edge to make it somewhat easier to manage.⁵

Another distinctive feature is the use of a five-line staff instead of the more common four-line staff for

³ The fragment is discussed in Peter Urquhart, "An Accidental Flat in Josquin's *Sine Nomine* Mass," *From Ciconia to Sweelinck: Donum natalicium Willem Elders*, eds. Albert Clement and Eric Jas (Amsterdam, 1994), 125–44.

⁴ Correspondence regarding the unknown provenance of Ms 710 is on file at the Beinecke Library, Yale University, New Haven, Connecticut.

⁵ See the descriptions in Vicente Rabanal, *Los cantorales de El Escorial* (Escorial, 1947), and Samuel Rubio, *Las melodias gregorianas de los "libros corales" del monasterio del Escorial: estudio crítico* (El Escorial, 1982). This impressive collection still awaits a comprehensive study. I am grateful to Friar Jafet Ortega, OSA, for facilitating my access to these manuscripts.

Ex. 1. Responsory in the underlayer of a palimpsest. New Haven, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Yale University. Ms. 710, fol. 103v.

(b) ta in il-las-tra re-ce-pit hy- spa-ni- am

[v.] Hoc ma-tu-ti-no si-de-re cla-ro ful-gas

hys-pa-ni-a lu-mi-ne

the notation of plainchant. The five-line staff is occasionally found in northern Italy but this, again, is a predominantly Spanish feature. Furthermore, the curious text division found in words such as “a-lme” (as opposed to “al-me”) and in many other places where a consonant is separated from a vowel it would normally accompany in non-Spanish sources might have provided a clue. Andrew Hughes observed this peculiar manner of text underlay while working with Catalan liturgical manuscripts and it is one I have encountered frequently in Castilian chant sources as well.⁶

After carefully studying each folio in the Beinecke Kyriale, more secure evidence to bolster these general observations on a Spanish provenance emerged. For one, there was the use of a corrector’s mark often found in Iberian sources. Initially, it closely resembles a percentage sign (%), but it is actually the word *ojo* (Spanish for “eye”)—an appropriate directive to indicate that attention is warranted. Of course, one might expect to find this sign in Latin American manuscripts as well. More certain, then, were two geographical references that became visible in the underlayer of a palimpsest with the help of ultraviolet light: “...ta in illustra receipt hyspaniam [v.] Hoc matutino sidere claro fulgas hyspania lumine” (Ex. 1).

The two references to Spain, *hyspaniam* and *hyspania*, are obviously most consequential. But the nature of this chant is also suggestive. Its overall form and content—the indication for a verse, the reciting tone, and particularly the reference to the “morning star” (*Hoc matutino sidere*)—suggest it is responsory for Matins. Furthermore, the inclusion of extra-liturgical references, such as “*hyspania*,” might well indicate that what we have here is an example of a *verbeta*—a special trope found in medieval Spanish books for the morning hours.⁷

All evidence to this point indicated that the Beinecke Kyriale presented a good example of a Spanish chantbook from the early sixteenth century; a good example of what Spaniards call a *cantoral*. This term is generally used to distinguish plainchant volumes like Ms 710 from *libros de coro* (“books of the choir”). The latter term indicates a large manuscript codex, consisting mostly of polyphonic music, that is usually liturgical.

Assured of its Spanish origin, the question turned to: where exactly in Spain did this *cantoral* come from? That question focused initially on two distinctive features in the illumination. One was the large initial inhabited by the “Virgin and Child” plus two men—one kneeling, the other standing. The second was the device of the Five Wounds on a white cloth,

⁶ Andrew Hughes, “Medieval Liturgical Books in Twenty-Three Spanish Libraries: Provisional Inventories,” *Traditio: Studies in Ancient and Medieval History, Thought, and Religion* 38 (1982): 370.

⁷ Ismael Fernández de la Cuesta, *Historia de la música española: desde los orígenes hasta el “ars nova”* (Madrid, 1983), 242.

displayed very much like a heraldic emblem in the borders. Each device is inscribed along the bottom with the words *Miserere Mei* in gold paint. My interest grew as I learned of five other leaves sharing precisely these two characteristics (Table 1). One is also at Yale's Beinecke Library, catalogued there as Ms 794. Others are preserved at the Pierpont Morgan Library in New York, the Detroit Public Library, and the Getty Museum in Los Angeles. The fifth leaf appeared recently in an exhibition by the antiquarian dealers Bruce Ferrini and Jörn Günther. The Morgan leaf was of particular interest since, like Beinecke Ms 710, it too depicts Hercules in its marginal decoration.

Working through acquisitions records pertaining to every leaf in a public collection, I was astonished to find that none had ever been traced to its original owner. Indeed, the mystery surrounding the Beinecke Kyriale at Yale had actually begun as early as 1958. That was the year the Pierpont Morgan purchased the related leaf that has since remained unattributed.⁸

Taken as a whole, the distinctive iconography shared by these separate folios and the Beinecke Kyriale revealed that none was an isolated product. Together they must have formed part of a set commissioned by the same person or institution. Judging from the most basic materials for their production—vellum, gold, rich pigments, and, not least, labor—it was clear that these deluxe *cantorales* reflected patronage stemming from extraordinary wealth. An individual patron was strongly suggested by the kneeling figure in the initial. Indeed, the prominent display of the initial itself also suggested a donor portrait. But upon closer inspection, it became clear that there was more here than first met the eye. Notice in the detail from the Beinecke Kyriale (Fig. 4) that the man kneeling on the left with his hands clasped in prayer wears a floral crown. Furthermore, the Virgin and Child each has in hand a single flower. Another man stands to the right of the enthroned Virgin. Judging from his clothing, helmet, and sword, he is some type of soldier. Every leaf in the related manuscript complex shares these characteristics.

⁸ See Fredrick B. Adams, Jr. *Ninth Report to the Fellows of the Pierpont Morgan Library, 1958 & 1959* (New York, 1959), 32–4; and correspondence regarding the unknown provenance of M. 887-1 on file at the Pierpont Morgan Library, New York, New York.

Table 1. Beinecke Ms 710 and Related Leaves

New Haven, Yale University, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Ms. 710	
Kyriale. 103 folios	
Illumination: Initial "R" with the Madonna and Child (<i>El Cavaller de Colunya</i>); border painting after Albrecht Dürer's <i>Das Meerwunder</i> (1498); emblems with Five Wounds and inscription "Miserere Mei"	
1.	Detroit, Detroit Public Library, Burton Historical Collection
	Gradual leaf
	Incipit: <i>Nos autem gloriari</i>
	Liturgical Use: Introit for Solemn Evening Mass on Maundy Thursday
	Illumination: Initial "N" with the Madonna and Child (<i>El Cavaller de Colunya</i>); emblems with Five Wounds and inscription "Miserere Mei"
2.	Los Angeles, J. Paul Getty Museum, Ms. 61
	Gradual leaf
	Incipit: <i>Judica me deus et discerne</i>
	Liturgical Use: Introit for Mass on First Sunday of the Passion
	Illumination: Initial "J" with the Madonna and Child (<i>El Cavaller de Colunya</i>); emblem with Five Wounds and inscription "Misere Mei" (sic)
3.	New Haven, Yale University, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Ms. 794
	Palimpsest. Gradual leaf (originally from an Antiphoner)
	Incipit: <i>Intret in conspectu tuo</i> . Originally <i>Sacerdos et pontifex</i>
	Liturgical Use: Introit for a Mass of Two or More Martyrs out of Paschal time. Originally antiphon preceding the Magnificat.
	Illumination: Initial "S" with the Madonna and Child (<i>El Cavaller de Colunya</i>); emblems with Five Wounds and inscription "Miserere Mei"
4.	New York, Pierpont Morgan Library, M. 887-1
	Gradual leaf
	Incipit: <i>Ad te levavi animam meam</i>
	Liturgical Use: Introit for First Sunday in Advent
	Illumination: Initial "A" with the Madonna and Child (<i>El Cavaller de Colunya</i>); emblems with Five Wounds and inscription "Miserere Mei"

Table 1 (continued).

5. Jörn Günther and Bruce P. Ferrini, *Overlooking the Ages: A Private Exhibition of Illuminated Manuscripts, Miniatures and Printed Books* (Hamburg, 1999), cat. no. 28.

Gradual leaf

Incipit: *Quasi modo geniti infantes*

Liturgical Use: Introit for Mass on Low Sunday

Illumination: Initial "Q" with the Madonna and Child (*El Cavaller de Colunya*); emblem with Five Wounds and inscription "Miserere Mei"

As it turns out, the subject of this illumination is not a donor portrait at all. It depicts a legend of the rosary known in Spain since the late fifteenth century as *El Cavaller de Colunya*, "The Knight of Cologne."⁹ Spaniards regarded this as a miracle tied to the famous rosary confraternity established at Cologne in 1475. The Cologne brotherhood enjoyed an enormous popularity. By 1482 it claimed to have enrolled over 100,000 members, and, among these, none could have been more prestigious than Emperor Frederick III. Due in no small part to the emperor's celebrity and the well-publicized sanction of Pope Sixtus IV, the rosary brotherhood of Cologne quickly extended its influence throughout Western Europe.¹⁰

The earliest written account of the "Knight of Cologne" in Spain dates from 1535. It is found in a tract printed for a Valencian rosary confraternity that survives in only one exemplar at the Biblioteca Colombina in Seville.¹¹ Briefly, the legend tells the story of a man who, having slain a friend in a quarrel, was beset by the victim's brother, a knight who sought to avenge his death. This knight eventually came upon the killer praying before an altar of the Virgin, but as he moved to strike down his sworn enemy, he noticed

⁹The legend and its sources are discussed at length in Lorenzo Candelaria, "El Cavaller de Colunya: A Miracle of the Rosary in the Choirbooks of San Pedro Mártir de Toledo," *Viator: Medieval and Renaissance Studies* 35 (2004): 221-64.

¹⁰Anne Winston-Allen, *Stories of the Rose: The Making of the Rosary in the Middle Ages* (University Park, PA, 1997), 4, 24-5, 66, 116, 127, 137.

¹¹Trellat *sumariament fet dela bulla, o cofraria del psaltiri o roser* (Valencia, 1535), A4v-A5v. Seville, Biblioteca Colombina, 14-2-7(10).



Fig. 4. Illuminated initial "R" with the Madonna and Child (*El Cavaller de Colunya*). New Haven, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Yale University. Ms. 710, fol. 1v (detail).

that the Mother of God stood before him, weaving a natural rosary from the roses that came out of his mouth while he prayed. When the rose garland was finished, the knight saw that the Virgin placed it upon the killer's head and forgave him for his most grievous crime. Overcome by this miraculous vision, the brother was deterred from seeking his revenge. The men proceeded to pray the rosary together, then parted as good friends.¹²

The image in the illuminations thus celebrated not only a miracle of the rosary, but also an ideal of *fraternitas*. Indeed, not only is a killer absolved of a grievous crime; he and the bereaved brother part as good friends!—all through the agency of a prayer that ensured Mary's intercession in time of need. It was a prayer, moreover, whose simplicity was one of its chief virtues. Then, as now, the basic form of the rosary was fifty *Ave Marias* or "Hail Marys"

¹²The legend is translated directly from the source in Candelaria, "El Cavaller de Colunya," 234.

divided into decades by five *Pater nosters*, or “Our Fathers.”¹³

While the Valencian tract of 1535 preserves the first extant written account, an engraving by Francisco Domènech for a Rosary confraternity in Barcelona demonstrates local knowledge of the miracle in 1488, almost fifty years before. One of the sections in that engraving clearly depicts the protagonist of the story kneeling by the Virgin, wearing a crown of roses, with three roses issuing from his mouth. The vengeful brother is also depicted (this time with a band of accomplices) raising a dagger to strike his brother’s killer. An inscription above the compartment identifies the scene as *miraculum militum*—“the miracle of the soldiers.”¹⁴

To follow up on the “Knight of Cologne” legend, I worked through seminal documents tied to the Cologne brotherhood only to find nothing of the tale. Pursuing other leads, it eventually became clear that the “Knight of Cologne” was actually a late fifteenth-century Spanish adaptation of a story that had circulated widely in German, Latin, French, and even Ethiopian and Arabic sources dating back to the thirteenth century. The story usually involves a monk or a merchant and a band of thieves in the woods, and can be found in the sermons of St. Vincent Ferrer, as well as in a medieval French miracle play titled *De un Marchant et un Larron*. An early musical rendering of the basic plot is also among the *Cantigas de Santa Maria* attributed to Alfonso the Wise.¹⁵

What did emerge from the Cologne documents, however, shed an interesting light on the emblem of the Five Wounds that bears the inscription *Miserere Mei* (Fig. 5). Traditionally, the emblem of the Five Wounds is one connected with the Franciscan Order (in Spain, as well as in Latin America)—a reference to the five stigmata that famously marked the founder of the Order, St. Francis of Assisi. But the Five Wounds were also important in the cult of the rosary, which was propagated primarily by the Dominican

¹³ In an Apostolic Letter of 16 October 2002 (*Rosarium Virginis Mariae*) Pope John Paul II added an *optional* five mysteries, the first major change to the rosary in over five hundred years. The “Luminous Mysteries,” or “Mysteries of Light” recall five events from the public life of Christ: 1) his baptism in the Jordan; 2) his miracles at the wedding of Cana; 3) his proclamation of the Kingdom of God and call to conversion; 4) his Transfiguration; and 5) his institution of the Eucharist as the sacramental expression of the Paschal Mystery.

¹⁴ Candelaria, “*El Cavaller de Colunya*,” 229–32, 263.

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, 237–45.



Fig. 5. Confraternity emblem of the Five Wounds with the inscription “*Miserere Mei*.” New Haven, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Yale University. Ms. 710, fol. 1v (detail).

Order. As it turns out, so was the penitential Fiftieth Psalm of David (Vulgate numbering), which begins “Have mercy on me Lord,” or in Latin, *Miserere Mei Deus*.

Perhaps the two most important printed documents emanating from the Cologne rosary confraternity in the year after its founding were Jakob Sprenger’s statutes for the brotherhood, and a scholarly defense of the rosary by Michael Franciscus de Insulis, a Dominican professor of theology at the University of Cologne.¹⁶ Relying heavily on number symbolism to help promote the rosary, Sprenger advanced a mystical union between the five “Our Fathers” of the

¹⁶ Jacobus Sprenger, *Erneuerte Rosenkranz-Bruderschaft* (Augsburg, 1476); Michael Franciscus de Insulis, *Determinatio quodlibetalis facta colonie* (Basel, 1476).

prayer and the Five Wounds of Christ. Likewise, Insulis compared the redemptive power of the fifty "Hail Marys" to that of the highly revered Fiftieth Psalm, the Penitential *Miserere Mei*.¹⁷ In my broad survey of documents tied to Spanish rosary confraternities, I found not only an intimate familiarity with the seminal Cologne texts, but that Sprenger and Insulis were cited with particular frequency by Spanish Dominicans.¹⁸

The inscribed emblem of the Five Wounds in the Beinecke Kyriale and its sister leaves is thus a concise statement reflecting the essential mysticism and redemptive power of the rosary. In borrowing from the symbolic language of the earliest documents emanating from Sprenger and his Cologne circle, the emblem pays homage to that important rosary brotherhood in a way that is consistent with the illumination depicting the "Knight of Cologne." While we might question the veracity of the legend in our day, there is no doubt of its profound significance to at least one rosary confraternity from early Renaissance Spain—the brotherhood that was connected in some capacity to the chantbooks that I have since come to designate as the "Rosary Cantorales."

To the extent that most of the chantbooks in this related complex have survived as leaves that, without regard to their artistic value, are essentially fragments, the situation reflects a common one in the study of manuscript sources. The largely intact Kyriale, Beinecke Ms 710, however, provided a substantial body of material for analysis. As the most complete exemplar of the "Rosary Cantorales," this Kyriale also offered the greatest potential for discovering something about the provenance of these manuscripts. A close study of its physical characteristics yielded proof of a Spanish origin. Its illumination suggested ties to a rosary confraternity. To refine the search further, I turned to its texts and music.

In terms of content, Beinecke Ms 710 is most unusual in that its chants are richly ornamented by tropes. Tropes are broadly understood as textual and/or musical additions to chants of the Mass that flourished from the ninth to twelfth centuries but which gradually fell out of fashion afterwards.¹⁹

They are thus distinctly late-medieval creations and rarely found after 1400. Yet, the Beinecke Kyriale transmits no fewer than twenty-one tropes for the Mass Ordinary: thirteen for the Kyrie, one for the Gloria, four for the Sanctus, and three for the Agnus Dei (Table 2).²⁰

Presented with an unattributed troped Kyriale, one might fruitfully consult some basic bibliographical tools to help determine the geographical distribution of texts and melodies through concordant sources. Toward that end, compilations such as *Analecta Hymnica*, *Repertorium Hymnologicum*, and the indices of chant published by students of Bruno Stäblein are of invaluable service.²¹ Spanish medievalists might turn to the chant and trope compilations of Ismael Fernández de la Cuesta and Eva Castro Caridad.²² These are fundamental sources for musical-liturgical research. In this case, however, efforts were initially hampered by the simple fact that Spanish chant and liturgy from the sixteenth century onward remain largely unstudied by musicologists.²³

Plainchant: A Handbook (Oxford, 1995), 196–238; and Eva Castro Caridad, *Tropos y troparios hispánicos* (Santiago de Compostela, 1991), 17–58.

²⁰My detailed study of these tropes is forthcoming in *Early Music* (May 2006).

²¹Clemens Blume and Guido M. Dreves, eds. *Analecta hymnica mediæ ævi*, vol. 47, *Tropen des Missale im Mittelalter* (Leipzig, 1905); Ulysse Chevalier, *Repertorium hymnologicum. Catalogue des chants, hymnes, proses, séquences, tropes en usage dans l'église latine depuis les origines jusqu'à nos jours*, 6 vols. (Louvain and Brussels, 1892–1921). Detlev Bosse, *Untersuchung einstimmiger mittelalterlicher Melodien zum "Gloria in excelsis deo."* *Forschungsbeiträge zur Musikwissenschaft*, vol. 2 (Regensburg, 1955); Margareta Melnicki, *Das einstimmige Kyrie des lateinischen Mittelalters*, *Forschungsbeiträge zur Musikwissenschaft*, vol. 1 (Regensburg, 1955); Martin Schildbach, *Das einstimmige Agnus Dei und seine handschriftliche Überlieferung von 10. bis zum 16. Jahrhunderts* (Erlangen, 1976). Peter Josef Thannabaur, *Das einstimmige Sanctus der römischen Messe in der handschriftlichen Überlieferung des 11. bis 16. Jahrhunderts*, *Erlanger Arbeiten zur Musikwissenschaft*, vol. 1 (Munich, 1962).

²²Castro Caridad, *Tropos y troparios*; Ismael Fernández de la Cuesta, *Manuscritos y fuentes musicales en España: edad media* (Madrid, 1980).

²³Professor Fernández de la Cuesta helped shape the course of my scholarly work with a simple but important question that was posed to me during a visit to El Real Conservatorio Superior de Música in Madrid: How can we claim to know anything about the celebrated Golden Age polyphony of Spain if we know absolutely nothing of the chant melodies that inspired it? He proceeded to share, with characteristic generosity, an important inventory of printed music books he had published, "Libros de

¹⁷ Sprenger, fol. 3r–v; Insulis, 6v–7r.

¹⁸ See for example, Hieronim Taix, O.P., *Libro de la institucion, manera de dir, miracles e indulgencies del roser de la verge Maria señora nuestra* (Barcelona, 1556), fols. 14r, 17r.

¹⁹ The scholarly repertory on tropes is extensive and varied. For general discussions see David Hiley, "Tropes," in *Western*

Table 2. Tropes for the Ordinary in Beinecke Ms 710

Kyrie

Rex virginum amator (fol. 1v)
 Cunctipotens genitor deus (fol. 3v)
 Summe deus (fol. 5)
 Rector cosmi pie (fol. 7)
 Pater excelse mariam (fol. 9)
 Kyrie fons bonitatis (fol. 11)
 Kyrie cunctipotens domine (fol. 13)
 Rex magne domine (fol. 15)
 Kyrie summe rex (fol. 17v)
 O pater immense dux noster (fol. 20)
 Iesu redemptor omnium (fol. 22)
 Xpriste patris genite (fol. 24v)
 Xpriste deus decus (fol. 27)

Gloria

Spiritus et alme (fol. 30v)

Sanctus (Osanna)

Clangat cetus iste letus (fol. 50)
 Celeste preconium (fol. 53)
 Osanna salvifica [...] rex angelorum (fol. 78)
 Clangat hodie vox [fragment] (fol. 81)

Agnus Dei

O Iesu salvator (fol. 81)
 Crimina tollis (fol. 82v)
 Ave maria celi regina (fol. 83)

The magnitude of this void in music history became especially clear as I worked through sources at a number of ecclesiastical institutions and research libraries in Spain, searching for chants that were concordant with those in the Beinecke Kyriale. In the course of eighteen months, it was astonishing to find several collections of late chant *cantorales* that in many cases had been placed in storage and forgotten: 114 at the Cathedral of Cordoba, 48 at the Biblioteca de Catalunya in Barcelona, 33 at the Cathedral of Avila. In New York City, there were 87 at the Hispanic Society of America. Untold troves surely await discovery elsewhere.

Even with the number of chants I was able to compile and study in a relatively short time, a much more defined picture came into view regarding the provenance of the Beinecke Kyriale. I also came to find that the Kyriale transmits two especially rare items

that had not been previously identified, in Spain or elsewhere. One is a trope for the Sanctus that I was able to recover from an erasure on fol. 78r–79v:

Osanna salvifica, [...] rex angelorum.
 Spes [...] [...] salus perfectorum
 In huius solennio de sudantem chorum
 Clementer constitue sub spe salvandorum
 Effantes retifica. rectos fac, constantes
 Huius sancti precibus salvate laudantes
 In mundi naufragio rege navigantes
 Ne mergantur fluctibus te glorificantes
 In excelsis.

The other item is a chant for the Gloria that appears on a later insertion (fol. 54r–55v).²⁴ It is preceded by a sign for *tempus imperfectum*. Thus, the chant is mensural and would have been performed in a moderate duple meter (Ex. 2). Overall, this melody reflects many characteristics of late Spanish chant. In addition to being mensural it is also much more diatonic than older chants tend to be. Here there is a marked bent toward melodic minor. The scalar melody with its occasional wide leap is more idiomatic of keyboard music than the voice, suggesting it might represent some internal line of a polyphonic Gloria for the organ. From a purely stylistic point of view, it seems to have been composed near the turn of the seventeenth century.

Instances such as these of “new” tropes and melodies for the Ordinary serve well to illustrate our imperfect understanding of Spanish chant and liturgy during and after the Renaissance. For the question of attribution, however, the most useful examples are those with known concordances, and particularly, those that are rare and limited in the geographical extent of their circulation. As signposts pointing toward specific musical-liturgical practices, these carry a potential for tracing more precisely the origins of this, or any unattributed liturgical manuscript with music.

In that respect, nine chants were especially useful. These are listed in Table 3 along with the provenance of each as reflected by the source. None is found outside of Spanish sources. With the exception of two Agnus Dei chants concentrated in Burgos, Tortosa, and Tarragona, it became apparent that this collection largely reflected the use of Toledo. My designation of the *Officia ad missas* (Granada, 1544) as Toledan

música impressos en España antes de 1900 (II). Siglos XV y XVI,” *Música: Revista del Real Conservatorio Superior de Música* 3 (1996): 10–29.

²⁴A tab sewn onto fol. 54 designates this as “Gloria de Apostoles.”

Ex. 2. Inserted Gloria ("de Apostoles"), ca. 1600. New Haven, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Yale University, Ms. 710, fol. 54r-55v.

Et in ter-ra pax ho - mi-ni-bus bo-ne vo-lun - ta - tis Lau-da - mus te Be-ne-di -

9
ci-mus te A - do - ra-mus te Glo-ri-fi - ca-mus te Gra-ti-as a - gi-mus ti - bi prop-ter mag -

18
nam glo - ri-am tu - am Do - mi-ne De-us rex ce-les - tis De-us pa - ter om - ni-po - tens Do -

27
mi-ne fi-li u-ni-ge-ni - te Je - su Chris - te do - mi-ne de-us ag-nus de - i fi - li-us pa - tris Qui

37
tol - lis pec - ca-ta mun - di mi-se-re-re no - bis Qui tol - lis pec - ca-ta mun - di sus - ci - pe

47
de - pre-ca - ti - o - nem nos - tram Qui se - des ad dex - te-ram pat - ris mi-se-re-re no - bis

55
Quo-ni-am tu so-lus sanc - tus Tu so-lus do-mi - nus Tu so-lus al - tis-si - mus Je - su Chris -

64
te Cum sanc-to spi - ri - tu in glo - ri - a De - i pa - tri - s A - men.

Table 3. Spanish Tropes and Melodies in Beinecke Ms. 710

1. Fol. 9 [Kyrie]
Pater excelsae mariam preparans eleyson
Iesu benigne mariam consecrans eleyson
Spiritus alme mariam obumbrans
1544 Granada, *Officia ad missas cantandum in festivitatis sanctorum per annum secundum consuetudinem romane curie: atque etiam de novo additis juxta usum sancte granatensis ecclesie* (fol. 9) [TOLEDO]
2. Fol. 13 [Kyrie]
Kyrie cunctipotens domine miserator eleyson
Xpriste verbum caro factum de virgine eleyson
Kyrie te celebrantibus una in te sperantibus eleyson
12 c. Montserrat, Biblioteca del Monasterio, Ms. 73 (fol. 7v) [MONTSERRAT]
13 c. Toledo, Biblioteca Capitular, Ms. 35-10 (fol. 117v) [TOLEDO]
14 c. Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, M. 1361 (fol. 180v) [TOLEDO]
1544 Granada, *Officia ad missas* (fol. 198v) [TOLEDO]
3. Fol. 17v [Kyrie]
Kyrie summe rex glorie sideream regens arcem potenter eleyson
Criste veteris macule purgator ade verbi gena eleyson
Kyrie sancte spiritus vivifice aspirans supplici tue promptus familie eleyson
12 c. Salamanca, Biblioteca Universitaria, Ms. 2637 (fol. 266v) [SILOS?]
13 c. Toledo, Biblioteca Capitular, Ms. 35-10 (fol. 177v) [TOLEDO]
14 c. Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, M. 1361 (fol. 181v) [TOLEDO]
4. Fol. 20 [Kyrie]
O pater immense dux noster mitissime eleyson.
Xpriste deus verbum patris qui mundi reatus clementer pertulisti eleyson
O paraclite alme ab utroque spiritus lux prefulgens procedens eterne nosterque consolator eleyson.
1539 Seville, *Manuale chori romanum noviter compilatum super omnia alia completissimum* (fol. 194v) [SEVILLE]
1544 Granada, *Officia ad missas* (fol. 100) [TOLEDO]

Table 3 (continued).

5. Fol. 24v [Kyrie]
Xpriste patris genite tocius gloria vite eleyson
Dextra paterna ream revoca miserando choream eleyson
Amborum flamen confer de more juvamen eleyson
14 c. Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, M. 1361 (fol. 182v) [TOLEDO]
15 c. Toledo, Biblioteca Capitular, Ms. 52-14 (fol. 38v) [TOLEDO]
16 c. Santo Domingo de Silos, Biblioteca del Monasterio, s.n. (fol. 60v) [SILOS]
6. Fol. 77 [Sanctus]
Melodic fragment.
1544 Granada, *Officia ad missas* (fol. 214v) [TOLEDO]
7. Fol. 79v [Sanctus]
Melody designated "De Angeles"
1707 Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, Ms. 18724/51 ("Ordo Missae del Misal Mixto Mozarabe") [copied in TOLEDO]
1789 Madrid, *Manual Procesional para el uso de la provincia de San Joseph de Franciscos Descalzos en Castilla la Nueva* [MADRID]
8. Fol. 82 [Agnus Dei]
O Iesu salvator dulcis consolator tua nobis dona expectata bona
O pacis amator o bonorum dator tua nobis dona expectata bona
De supernis vite nobis dona mitte sicut permisisti quando recessisti
14 c. Burgos, Monasterio de las Huelgas, s.n. (fol. 18) [BURGOS]
9. Fol. 83 [Agnus Dei]
Ave maria celi regina domini mei mater alma
13 c. Tortosa, Biblioteca Capitular, Ms. 135 (fol. 35) [TORTOSA]
14 c. Barcelona, Biblioteca del Orfeò Catalè, Ms. 1 (fol. 9) [TARRAGONA]

reflects the fact that the liturgical practices of Toledo were implemented in Granada immediately following the Spanish conquest of this last Muslim stronghold on the Iberian Peninsula in 1492.²⁵ Indeed, the *Officia ad missas* commemorates that very occasion with a frontispiece depicting the surrender of Granada by sultan Boabdil (Abu'abd Allah Muhammad

²⁵ Francisco Bermudez de Pedrazas, *Historia ecclesiastica, principios, y progresos de la ciudad, y religion catolica en Granada* (Granada, 1638), fols. 169v-171r, 172r-173v, describes

XI) to King Fernando, Queen Isabella, and the powerful Toledan Cardinal Pedro González de Mendoza (prelacy 1482–95).

With my attention particularly focused on Toledo, I soon came upon another discovery of import. In my codicological study of the Beinecke Kyriale, I frequently came across two very peculiar types of folded notes with tails—one with two tails pointing up, the other with two tails pointing down—that are not typical in square chant notation. An example appears above the word “vir-gin-um” in Fig. 1, although the tails pointing upward are scarcely visible in the illustration. These distinctive note shapes resurfaced with frequency in Toledan sources dating from the fifteenth through eighteenth centuries, and were subsequently explained in an anonymous sixteenth-century chant treatise now at the Biblioteca de Catalunya (Ms 1325). The treatise referred to them as *tocus* and *uncus*, and placed them among eight principal figures used for ornamenting plainchant in Toledo:

Tocus is a figure resembling a breve with two plicas upward, and it was invented to signal that the voice should be repelled upward and then return to the same point in the place of the melody. *Uncus* is a figure like a breve with two plicas downward and it was invented to repel the voice downward then return to the same point.²⁶

Essentially, these ornaments represent what we would call double grace notes today. The anonymous theorist records that the ornaments were collectively referred to as *estrunto* in Toledo, a word undoubtedly related to the modern Castilian *estruendo*, meaning a big noise or disruption.²⁷

Interestingly enough, while concordances for rare items in Beinecke Ms 710 pointed generally to the use of Toledo, the more intimate bond with the city of Toledo itself was reflected by the uncommon

the surrender of Granada and the subsequent installment of Toledan musical-liturgical practices.

²⁶“Tocus es figura sicut brevis con dos plicas azia riba, fue inventada en senyal de repelar la voz aza riba y tornar al mesmo punto en lugar de melodia. Uncus est figura como breve con dos plicas, azia baxo, y fue inventada para repelar la voz azia baxo y tornar al mesmo punto.” Barcelona, Biblioteca de Catalunya, Ms. 1325, fol. 21v. The treatise is available in a modern edition by Karl-Werner Gimpel, in “El canto melódico de Toledo: algunas reflexiones sobre su origen y estilo,” *Recerca Musicològica* 8 (1988): 38–45.

²⁷“Y estas dos [tocus and uncus] llaman en Toledo estrunto.” Barcelona, Ms. 1325, fol. 21v.

ornamental tones in many of the chants in this Kyriale. Later, I was pleased to learn of corroborating evidence in ornamentation of another kind. The Hercules iconography appearing in the marginalia of the Beinecke Kyriale and related Morgan leaf (M. 887-1) had not been the mere whim of an illuminator. Indeed, since at least the mid-fourteenth century, Hercules was believed not only to have founded Toledo, but to have lived there in an enchanted cave. To this day, residents of the city take special pleasure in pointing out the legendary *Cueva de Hercules* near the site formerly occupied by the church of San Ginés, destroyed in 1840. It was only recently identified as the ruin of an elaborate Roman aqueduct system that channeled water from the Tagus river into the center of town.²⁸

Convinced at that point of a Toledan origin and some connection with a rosary confraternity, the search narrowed to five Dominican houses in the province of Toledo. (In Spain, and elsewhere, rosary confraternities were tied almost exclusively to the Dominican Order.) Based on foundation dates, four could be ruled out, as the two earliest among them were established in 1527—about a quarter of a century too late for the *cantorales*.²⁹ The only viable candidate was the Dominican monastery of San Pedro Mártir de Toledo, founded in 1407.³⁰ As the only Dominican monastery within the medieval city walls, San Pedro Mártir looked especially promising. But did it have any connection with a rosary confraternity?

Working through local histories, chronicles of the Dominican Order, and documents at the diocesan archive of Toledo, I was able to confirm not only that it did, but that the rosary confraternity tied to San Pedro Mártir was one of extraordinary fame and wealth in its time. While exceptions were made for the richest noblemen of the city, official statutes limited membership to those in the silk weaving trade—a lucrative industry, and a cornerstone of the Toledan economy since the last quarter of the fifteenth

²⁸Candelaria, “Hercules and Albrecht Dürer’s *Das Meerwunder*,” 19–22.

²⁹The four (and their foundation dates) are: San Jacinto de Madridejos (1602), San Antonio de Yepes (1587), San Ginés de Talavera de la Reina (1527), and Santo Domingo de Ocaña (1527). Manuel María de los Hoyos, *Registro documental, tomo I: material inédito dominicano español* (Madrid, 1961), 67–70.

³⁰Candelaria, “*El Cavaller de Colunya*,” 222–24, presents a brief historical overview of the Dominican Order in Toledo and, especially, their religious house of San Pedro Mártir.

century. The rosary brotherhood of silk weavers kept a substantial treasury at San Pedro Mártir. Surviving account books reflect that the confraternity generously endowed the monastery with funds to sustain monthly rosary Masses which were often preceded by grand processions that included music and fireworks. Other gifts of note were expensive altar-pieces, silk draperies for the cloisters, as well as an elaborate throne, and ornate dresses for a beloved image of the Virgin in their rosary chapel.³¹

The monastery of San Pedro Mártir is an awe-inspiring sight in and of itself. Although it began as a modest cobbling of houses in 1407, by the middle of the eighteenth century, it boasted a surface area rivaling even the great cathedral of Toledo. At its peak, it measured over 20,000 square meters (66,000 square feet) and included two conventual churches and four cloisters.³² Judging from its surviving double choir stalls that accommodated 122 Dominican friars, Masses celebrated at San Pedro Mártir must have been every bit as grand as the convent itself. Had the "Rosary Cantorales" been the liturgical instruments used in those surely magnificent celebrations?

The circumstances would appear to answer that question in the affirmative. But the end to any good mystery always requires a "smoking gun"—in this case, a *cantoral* of similar design that had survived at the monastery. I was assured, however, that none would be found there. Between 1835 and 1837, decrees of exlaustation issued under the governmental reforms of Juan Álvarez Mendizábal led to the dissolution of virtually every religious house in Spain, including San Pedro Mártir de Toledo.³³ Only four religious communities were left intact, one of them housed at the monastery of Santo Domingo in Ocaña, a small town not far from Toledo.³⁴

On paying a visit to Santo Domingo, I learned from one of the brothers, Friar Jesús Santos (who also served as the archivist) that following the dissolution of San Pedro Mártir on 28 January 1836, the

Dominican monastery of Ocaña assumed ownership of a complete set of *cantorales* that had belonged to the Dominicans of Toledo.³⁵ All of them dated from the sixteenth century and remained at Santo Domingo de Ocaña until the Spanish Civil War of the 1930s when they disappeared without anyone knowing where they had gone.³⁶

Toward the end of our visit, Friar Santos brought out an envelope containing large calligraphic letters that he claimed had been cut out of those manuscripts. Upon seeing them I was immediately struck by their similarity in overall design and ornament to those in the Beinecke Kyriale, right down to the penwork flourishes. After examining the fragments more closely, I realized that Friar Santos had given me the "smoking gun" I was looking for, because several of these letters were inscribed with incipits to the rosary's fundamental prayer: *Ave maria gratia plena*—"Hail Mary full of Grace" (Figs. 6 and 7). In the absence of identifying emblems and illuminations, there could be no stronger indication than these prayer incipits that the Toledan confraternity had indeed some connection to these *cantorales*.

The case was thus put to rest. Considered from the various disciplinary perspectives of codicology, art history, liturgics, popular religion, and, of course, musicology—the assembled body of evidence firmly placed original ownership of the "Rosary Cantorales" with the Dominican monastery of San Pedro Mártir in Toledo. But reflecting on my journey to that conclusion, I realize now, that, while uncovering the origin of these deluxe manuscripts was of some import, a much broader significance resided (and continues to reside) in their roles as remarkable cultural artifacts—witnesses to the largely unstudied musical, artistic and religious cultures of early Renaissance Spain.³⁷

³⁵ The unceremonious exlaustation of San Pedro Mártir is described in Julio Porres Martín-Cleto, *La desamortización del siglo XIX en Toledo* (Toledo, 1965), 429.

³⁶ "En dicho convento había una colección de 'cantorales' del siglo XVI, que después de la 'desamortización de Mendizábal' en 1835, pasaron al convento de Santo Domingo de Ocaña. Aquí estuvieron hasta la pasada Guerra Civil Española (1936–1939) en que desaparecieron sin que sepa a donde fueron a parar." Personal communication from Friar Jesús Santos, OP of Santo Domingo de Ocaña.

³⁷ The cultural significance of the Beinecke Kyriale is the subject of my book *The Rosary Cantoral: Ritual and Social Design in a Chantbook from Early Renaissance Toledo*, forthcoming from the University of Rochester Press.

³¹ *Ibid.*, 221–22, 245–51.

³² *Ibid.*, 222.

³³ See the article "Desamortización" in *Enciclopedia universal ilustrada europeo-americana*, vol. 18 (1915; repr. Madrid, 1987), 360–70.

³⁴ Friar Manuel González, OP, of the Convento de San Pedro Mártir in Madrid (there is no connection with the Toledan house) informed me in a personal communication that the four communities that were allowed to remain were the Dominicans of Ocaña, and the Augustinians of Valladolid, Burgos, and Montuedo (Navarra).



Fig. 6. Fragment from a sixteenth-century cantoral of San Pedro Mártir, Toledo with "Ave Ma[ria]." Ocaña, Convento de Santo Domingo, s.n.



Fig. 7. Fragment from a sixteenth-century cantoral of San Pedro Mártir, Toledo with "Ave Maria Gra[tia plena]." Ocaña, Convento de Santo Domingo, s.n.